'Law and Covid-19 in New Zealand'

Health Law Symposium in honour of Prof Olivier Guillod, Neuchâtel, August 2021

John Dawson
Faculty of Law, University of Otago
New Zealand

Power of New Zealand Parliament to enact new legislation rapidly

- New Zealand's constitution similar to UK's
- No entrenched constitutional limits on law-making power of NZ Parliament
- No federal system (a unitary state)
- One chamber of Parliament (unicameral)
- Government now has a majority in Parliament

Central legal issues in New Zealand's response to Covid-19

- The need for adequate public health legislation, in advance
- Determining which government responses must be *authorised by law*
- When can employers *demand* that workers be vaccinated?

The need for adequate public health legislation, in advance

- Weaknesses in prior public health legislation
- Government response unlawful in some respects

Resolved in practice by:

- deferential judicial approach to review
- delay in hearing cases and delivering judgment
- rapid enactment of new legislation
 - "... trying to preserve a balance between rule-governed and discretionary decision-making in times of crisis."

Nga Kaitiaki Tuku Iho Medical Action Society Inc v Minister of Health [2021] NZHC 1107 (the 'vaccine approval' case)

- law permitted rapid approval of vaccine for use with 'a limited number of patients'
- strong argument that approval of vaccine for all adults was unlawful
- court refused 'interim' relief, before full hearing
- giving Parliament time to change the law (and retrospectively validate the approval)

When must a government response to Covid be *authorised by law?*

- Executive 'announcements':
 - 'imperative language'
 - encouragement or command?
- When is behaviour 'prohibited'?
- When are 'rights' limited?
- All limits to be 'prescribed by law'

When can employers demand that employees be vaccinated?

- Conflict between employers' duty to:
 - treat employees fairly; and
 - promote 'health and safety'(of other employees and customers)
- So far, resolved by legislation requiring 'border workers' to be vaccinated

Some References

Legislation:

Covid-19 Public Health Response Act 2020 (NZ)

Court judgments:

Borrowdale v Director-General of Health [2020] NZHC 2090 (under appeal)

Nga Kaitiaki Tuku Iho Medical Action Society Inc v Minister of Health [2021] NZHC 1107

Commentary:

'New Zealand's legal response to Covid-19: a symposium' (2020) 31(4) *Public Law Review* 370-397

For full New Zealand bibliography see:

https://www.wgtn.ac.nz/public-law/projects/covid/covid-19-and-beyond-public-law